

SUGGESTED SOLUTION

CA INTERMEDIATE NOV '19

SUBJECT-LAW

Test Code – CIM 8356

BRANCH - () (Date:)

Head Office : Shraddha, 3rd Floor, Near Chinai College, Andheri (E), Mumbai – 69.

Tel: (022) 26836666

DIVISION A

- 1. D
- 2. D
- 3. B
- 4. C
- 5. C
- 6. D
- 7. D
- 8. D
- 9. C
- 10. D
- 11. A
- 12. D
- 13. B
- 14. D
- 15. A
- 16. C
- 17. B
- 18. B
- 19. A
- 20. D
- 21. C

DIVISION B

ANSWER-1

A. Sweat equity shares of a class of shares already issued.

According to section 54 of the Companies Act, 2013, a company may issue sweat equity shares of a class of shares already issued, if the following conditions are fulfilled, namely—

- (i) the issue is **authorised by a special resolution** passed by the company;
- (ii) the **resolution specifies** the number of shares, the current market price, consideration, if any, and the class or classes of directors or employees to whom such equity shares are to be issued;
- (iii) where the equity shares of the company are **listed on a recognised stock** exchange, the sweat equity shares are issued in accordance with the regulations made by the Securities and Exchange Board in this behalf and if they are not so listed, the sweat equity shares are issued in accordance with such rules as prescribed under Rule 8 of the *Companies (Share and Debentures) Rules, 2014,*

The rights, limitations, restrictions and provisions as are for the time being applicable to equity shares shall be applicable to the sweat equity shares issued under this section and the holders of such shares shall rank *pari passu* with other equity shareholders.

Data Limited can issue Sweat equity shares by following the conditions as mentioned above. It does not make a difference that the company is just a few months old.

(1 MARK)

B. As per Rule 3 of *the Companies (Incorporation) Rules, 2014,* One Person Company (OPC) cannot convert voluntarily into any kind of company unless two years have expired from the date of incorporation, except where the paid up share capital is increased beyond fifty lakh rupees or its average annual turnover during the relevant period exceeds two crore rupees.

Besides, Section 18 of the Companies Act, 2013 provides that a company of any class registered under this Act may convert itself as a company of other class under this Act by alteration of memorandum and articles of the company in accordance with the provisions of the Chapter II of the Act.

According to the above provisions, following are the answers to the given circumstances:

- a. Where, if the promotors increases the paid up capital of the company by Rs. 10.00 lakh during 2017-2018 i.e., to Rs. 55 lakh (45+10= 55), 'New' (OPC) may convert itself voluntarily into any other kind of company due to increase in the paid up share capital exceeding 50 lakh rupees. This could be done by the 'New' by alteration of memorandum and articles of the company in compliance with the Provisions of the Act.
- b. Where if the turnover of the 'New' during 2017-18 was Rs. 3.00 crore, there will be no change in the answer, as it meets up the requirement of minimum turnover i.e., Rs. 2 crore for voluntarily conversion of 'New' (OPC) into any other kind of company.

(6 MARKS)

- C. (i) According to section 134 of the Indian Contract Act, 1872, the surety is discharged by any contract between the creditor and the principal debtor, by which the principal debtor is released or by any act or omission of the creditor, the legal consequence of which is the discharge of the principal debtor. In the given case, B does not supply the necessary material as per the agreement. Hence, C is discharged from his liability.
 - (ii) According to Section 136 of the Indian Contract Act, 1872, where a contract to give time to the principal debtor is made by the creditor with a third person and not with the principal debtor, the surety is not discharged. In the given question the contract to give time to the principal debtor is made by the creditor with X who is a third person. X is not the principal debtor. Hence, A is not discharged.

(2*2 = 4 MARKS)

D. The question arising in this problem is whether the making of promissory note is complete when one half of the note was delivered to Umesh. Under Section 46 of the Negotiable Instruments Act, 1881, the making of a promissory note is completed by delivery, actual or constructive. Delivery refers to the whole of the instrument and not merely a part of it. Delivery of half instrument cannot be treated as constructive delivery of the whole. So, the claim of Umesh to have the other half of the promissory note sent to him is not maintainable. Manoj is justified in demanding the

return of the first half sent by him. He can change his mind and refuse to send the other half of the promissory note.

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-2

A. "Eligible company" means a public company as referred to in sub-section (1) of section 76, having a net worth of not less than one hundred crore rupees or a turnover of not less than five hundred crore rupees and which has obtained the prior consent of the company in general meeting by means of a special resolution and also filed the said resolution with the Registrar of Companies before making any invitation to the Public for acceptance of deposits:

However, an eligible company, which is accepting deposits within the limits specified under clause (c) of sub-section (1) of section 180, may accept deposits by means of an ordinary resolution.

An eligible company shall accept or renew any deposit from its members, if the amount of such deposit together with the amount of deposits outstanding as on the date of acceptance or renewal of such deposits from members exceeds ten per cent. of the aggregate of the Paid-up share capital, free Reserves and securities premium account of the company.

ABC Limited is having a net worth of 120 crore rupees. Hence, it can fall in the category of eligible company.

(3 MARKS)

Thus, ABC has to ensure that acceptance deposits from members should not exceed 10% of the aggregate of the Paid-up share capital, free Reserves and securities premium account of the company.

(1 MARK)

- B. In terms of section 2 (87) of the Companies Act 2013 "subsidiary company" or "subsidiary", in relation to any other company (that is to say the holding company), means a company in which the holding company
 - a. controls the composition of the Board of Directors; or
 - b. exercises or controls more than one-half of the total voting power either at its own or together with one or more of its subsidiary companies:

Explanation.—For the purposes of this clause,—

- (a) a company shall be deemed to be a subsidiary company of the holding company even if the control referred to in sub-clause (i) or sub-clause (ii) is of another subsidiary company of the holding company;
- (b) the composition of a company's Board of Directors shall be deemed to be controlled by another company if that other company by exercise of some power exercisable by it at its discretion can appoint or remove all or a majority of the directors.

In the present case, New Pvt. Ltd. and Ultra Pvt. Ltd. together hold less than one half of the total share capital i.e. less than one-half of total voting power. Hence, PQR Private Ltd. (holding of New Pvt. Ltd. and Ultra Pvt. Ltd.) will not be a holding company of Altar Pvt. Ltd.

(5 MARKS)

However, if PQR Pvt. Ltd. has 8 out of 9 Directors on the Board of Altar Pvt. Ltd. i.e. controls the composition of the Board of Directors; it (PQR Pvt. Ltd.) will be treated as the holding company of Altar Pvt. Ltd.

(1 MARK)

- C. "Immovable Property" [Section 3(26) of the General Clauses Act, 1897]: 'Immovable Property' shall include:
 - a. Land
 - b. Benefits to arise out of land, and
 - c. Things attached to the earth, or
 - d. Permanently fastened to anything attached to the earth.

It is an inclusive definition. It contains four elements: land, benefits to arise out of land, things attached to the earth and things permanently fastened to anything attached to the earth. Where, in any enactment, the definition of immovable property is in the negative and not exhaustive, the definition as given in the General Clauses Act will apply to the expression given in that enactment.

In the instant case, X sold Land along with timber (obtained after cutting trees) of fifty tamarind trees of his land. According to the above definition, Land is immovable property; however, timber cannot be immovable property since the same are not attached to the earth.

(4 MARKS)

D. **Dictionary Definitions:** First we refer the Act in question to find out if any particular word or expression is defined in it. Where we find that a word is not defined in the Act itself, we may refer to dictionaries to find out the general sense in which that word is commonly understood. However, in selecting one out of the several meanings of a word, we must always take into consideration the context in which it is used in the Act. It is the fundamental rule that the meanings of words and expressions used in an Act must take their colour from the context in which they appear. Further, judicial decisions laying down the meaning of words in construing statutes in 'pari materia' will have greater weight than the meaning furnished by dictionaries. However, for technical terms, reference may be made to technical dictionaries.

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-3

A. (i) Provisions and Explanation: Section 141(3) (c) of the Companies Act, 2013 prescribes that any person who is a partner or in employment of an officer or employee of the company will be disqualified to act as an auditor of a company. Sub-section (4) of Section 141 provides that an auditor who becomes subject, after his appointment, to any of the disqualifications specified in sub-sections (3) of Section 141, he shall be deemed to have vacated his office as an auditor.

Conclusion: In the present case, Ayush, an auditor of X Ltd., joined as partner with B, who is Finance executive of X Ltd., has attracted clause (3) (c) of Section 141 and, therefore, he shall be deemed to have vacated office of the auditor of X Limited.

(3 MARKS)

(ii) As per section 141 (3)(d) (i) an auditor is disqualified to be appointed as an auditor if he, or his relative or partner holding any security of or interest in the company or its subsidiary, or of its holding or associate company or a subsidiary of such holding company:

In the present case, Mr. Abhi. is holding security of `1000 in the Abhiman Ltd, therefore he is not eligible for appointment as an Auditor of "Abhiman Ltd."

(2 MARKS)

B. The Companies Act, 2013 by virtue of provisions as contained in Section 39 (1) and (2) regulates and restricts the minimum subscription and the application money payable in a public issue of shares as under:

Minimum subscription [Section 39 (1)]

No Allotment shall be made of any securities of a company offered to the public for subscription; unless; -

- a. the amount stated in the prospectus as the minimum amount has been subscribed; and
- b. the sums payable on application for such amount has been paid to and received by the company-

Application money: Section 39 (2) provides that the amount payable on application on each security shall not be less than 5% of the nominal amount of such security or such amount as SEBI may prescribe by making any regulations in this behalf.

Further section 39 (3) provides that if the stated minimum amount is not received by the company within 30 days of the date of issue of the prospectus or such time as prescribed by SEBI, the company will be required to refund the application money received within such time and manner as may be prescribed.

In case of any default under sub-section, the company and its officer who is in default shall be liable to a penalty, for each default, of one thousand rupees for each day during which such default continues or one lakh rupees, whichever is less.

Section 40 (3) provides that all moneys received on application from the public for subscription to the securities shall be kept in a separate bank account maintained with a scheduled bank.

(5 MARKS)

C. Section 124 of the Indian Contract Act, 1872 says that "A contract by which one party promises to save the other from loss caused to him by the conduct of the promisor himself, or the conduct of any person", is called a "contract of indemnity".

Section 126 of the Indian Contract Act says that "A contract to perform the promise made or discharge liability incurred by a third person in case of his default." is called as "contract of guarantee".

The conditions under which the guarantee is invalid or void are stated in section 142,143 and 144 of the Indian Contract Act are :

- a. Guarantee obtained by means of misrepresentation.
- b. creditor obtained any guarantee by means of keeping silence as to material circumstances.
- c. When contract of guarantee is entered into on the condition that the creditor shall not act upon it until another person has joined in it as co-surety and that other party fails to join as such.

(4 MARKS)

D. As per section 91 of the Negotiable Instruments Act, 1881, a bill may be dishonoured either by non-acceptance or by non-payment.

Dishonour by non-acceptance may take place in any one of the following circumstances:

- (i) When the drawee either does not accept the bill within forty-eight hours (exclusive of public holidays) of presentment or refuse to accept it;
- (ii) When one of several drawees, not being partners, makes default in acceptance;
- (iii) When the drawee makes a qualified acceptance;
- (iv) When presentment for acceptance is excused and the bill remains unaccepted; and
- (v) When the drawee is incompetent to contract.

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-4

A. The Companies Act, 2013 under section 13 provides for the process of altering the Memorandum of a company. Since the location or Registered Office clause in the Memorandum only names the state in which its registered office is situated, a change in address from Mumbai to Nashik, does not result in the alteration of the Memorandum and hence the provisions of section 13 (and its sub sections) do not apply in this case.

However, under section 12 (5) of the Act which deals with the registered office of company, the change in registered office from one town or city to another in the same state, must be approved by a special resolution of the company. Further, presuming that the Registrar will remain the same for the whole state of Maharashtra, there will be no need for the company to seek the confirmation to such change from the Regional Director.

(4 MARKS)

- B. Section 127 of the Companies Act, 2013 lays down the penalty for non payment of dividend within the prescribed time period. Under section 127 where a dividend has been declared by a company but has not been paid or the warrant in respect thereof has not been posted within 30days from the date of declaration to any shareholder entitled to the payment of the dividend:
 - (a) every director of the company shall, if he is knowingly a party to the default, be punishable with imprisonment which may extend to two years and with fine which shall not be less than one thousand rupees for every day during which such default continues; and
 - (b) the company shall be liable to pay simple interest at the rate of eighteen per cent. per annum during the period for which such default continues.

Therefore, in the given case Mr Rajan will not succeed in his claim for 20% interest as the limit under section 127 is 18% per annum.

(6 MARKS)

- C. According to section 27 of the General Clauses Act, 1897, where any legislation or regulation requires any document to be served by post, then unless a different intention appears, the service shall be deemed to be effected by:
 - a. properly addressing
 - b. pre-paying, and
 - c. posting by registered post.

A letter containing the document to have been effected at the time at which the letter would be delivered in the ordinary course of post.

Hence, where the where the notice could not be served on account of the fact that the house of Mr P was found locked, it will be deemed that the notice was properly served as per the provisions of Section 27 of the General Clauses Act, and it would be for Mr. P to prove that it was not really served and that he was not responsible for such non- service.

(4 MARKS)

D. The normal function of a proviso is to except something out of the enactment or to qualify something stated in the enactment which would be within its purview if the proviso were not there. The effect of the proviso is to qualify the preceding enactment which is expressed in terms which are too general. As a general rule, a proviso is added to an enactment to qualify or create an exception to what is in the enactment ordinarily a proviso is not interpreted as it stating a general rule.

It is a cardinal rule of interpretation that a proviso to a particular provision of a statute only embraces the field which is covered by the main provision. It carves out an exception to the provision to which it has been enacted as a proviso and not to the other. (*Ram Narain Sons Ltd. Vs. Assistant Commissioner of Sales Tax. A.I.R,1995 SC 765*)

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-5

A. The term charge has been defined in section 2 (16) of the Companies Act, 2013 as an interest or lien created on the property or assets of a company or any of its undertakings or both as security and includes a mortgage.

Every company is under an obligation to keep at its registered office a register of charges and enter therein all charges specifically affecting property of the company and all floating charges on the undertaking or any property of the company.

Punishment for contravention – According to section 86 of the Companies Act, 2013, if a company makes any default with respect to the registration of charges covered under chapter VI, a penalty shall be levied, ranging from Rs. 1 lakh to 10 lakhs.

Every defaulting officer is punishable with imprisonment for a term not exceeding 6 months or fine which shall not be less than 25,000 rupees, but not exceeding 1 lakh rupees or both.

(5 MARKS)

B. A Proxy is an instrument in writing executed by a shareholder authorizing another person to attend a meeting and to vote thereat on his behalf and in his absence. As per the provisions of Section 105 of the Companies Act, 2013, every shareholder who is entitled to attend and vote has a statutory right to appoint another person as his proxy. It is not necessary that the proxy be a member of the company. Further, any provision in the articles of association of the company requiring instrument of proxy to be lodged with the company more than 48 hours before a meeting shall have effect as if 48 hours had been specified therein. The members have a right to revoke the proxy's authority by voting himself before the proxy has voted but once the proxy has voted the member cannot retract his authority.

Where two proxy instruments by the same shareholder are lodged of in such a manner that one is lodged before and the other after the expiry of the date fixed for lodging proxies, the former will be counted.

Thus, in case of member X, the proxy Y will be permitted to vote on his behalf as form for appointing proxy was submitted within the permitted time.

However, in the case of Member W, the proxy M (and not Proxy N) will be permitted to vote as the proxy authorizing N to vote was deposited in less than 48 hours before the meeting.

(5 MARKS)

- C. Under section 134(1) of the Companies Act, 2013 the financial statement, including consolidated financial statement, if any, shall be approved by the Board of Directors before they are signed on behalf of the Board by at least:
- (a) The chairperson of the company where he is authorised by the Board; or
- (b) Two directors out of which one shall be managing director and the Chief Executive Officer, if he is a director in the company, and
- (c) the Chief Financial Officer and the company secretary of the company, wherever they are appointed.

In the instant case, the Balance Sheet and Profit and Loss Account have been signed by Mr. Ghanshyam and Mr. Hyder, the directors. In view of Section 134(1) of the Companies Act, 2013, Mr. Indersen, the Managing Director should be one of the two signing directors. Since the company has also employed a full time Secretary, he should also sign the Balance Sheet and Profit and Loss Account.

(4 MARKS)

D. As per Section 44 of the Negotiable Instruments Act, 1881, when the consideration for which a person signed a promissory note, bill of exchange or cheque consisted of money, and was originally absent in part or has subsequently failed in part, the sum which a holder standing in immediate relation with such signer is entitled to receive from him is proportionally reduced. Explanation—The drawer of a bill of exchange stands in immediate relation with the acceptor. The maker of a promissory note, bill of exchange or cheque stands in immediate relation with the payee, and the endorser with his endorsee. Other signers may by agreement stand in immediate relation with a holder. On the basis of above provision, P would succeed to recover Rs. 7,000 only from Q and not the whole amount of the bill because it was accepted for value as to Rs. 7,000 only and an accommodation to P for Rs. 3,000. (3 MARKS)